STAND-ALONE PROJECT - FINAL REPORT

P 22965-G21 Project number

Project title	The murals in the medical college at Labrang Monastery
Project leader	Mag. Dr. Katharina Anna Sabernig
Project website ¹	www.katharinasabernig.at

Part 1 of the project report is intended for interested members of the public; parts 2-4 are addressed to reviewers and <u>must be submitted in the language of the original application</u>.
Part 5 provides an opportunity to report to the FWF on interactions with the administration during the course of the project.

The complete report must be submitted in hardcopy and on electronic medium (CD or floppy disc) in Word for Windows format. Guidelines and forms for the final report can be downloaded from the FWF web site

(http://www.fwf.ac.at/de/faq/einzelprojekte/evaluierung.html)

Projects that started after 01.01.2009 are required to have a website

1. Summary for public relations work

The project's most important results (scientific advances) from the project leader's point of view should be presented on a single page (DIN A4, 11 pt type, line spacing 1.5) in a way that is accessible to the general public. It is important to use as few technical terms as possible, so that the text is interesting and understandable to people not familiar with the field. The main point should be placed at the start of the summary. Please keep descriptions of the issues addressed and results obtained short and succinct. Possible applications to or implications for social, cultural, ecological, medical, economic or technological areas should be briefly mentioned.

The summary should be submitted as hardcopy and also electronically both in **German** and in **English** (in Word for Windows format, <u>without special symbols</u>). The summaries will be made available via the FWF's project database. The FWF will not edit the summaries, so the authors bear full responsibility for the contents.

2. Brief project report

- to be written in the language of the original application
- target group: peer reviewers
- Length: not to exceed 16,000 characters in total

(approx. 2,400 words or 4 pages, 11 pt type, single-spaced,

no attachments apart from those mentioned in section 4)

2.1 Report on the scientific work

2.1.1 information on the development of the research work (2000 characters excl. spaces) overall scientific concept and goals

The overall scientific concept of the project was to examine the murals in the courtyard of the Medical College at Labrang Monastery in terms of their: content, didactic value as well as their historical setting.

The content is analysed using different tabular lists. One table includes all the inscriptions that were written on the murals before they were repainted in 2007, compared with the inscriptions on the versions painted in 2007 and their textual template written by BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS, a personal physician of the Fifth Dalai Lama. This text could be proved as the basis for the murals. In 2011, the repainted murals were documented at Labrang. This was in order to document the differences between the two versions and to confirm their stable state of information.

The specifications of the leaves, which are mentioned in BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS' text, have been compared with the second part of the *Rgyud bzhi* called *Bshad rgyud*. Descriptions, which go beyond this classical treatise, have been compared with two of its commentaries: the *Vaidurya sngon po* and the older *Mes po'i zhal lung*. Moreover, to ascertain the didactic value of the Labrang murals as Tibetan medical paintings their content and style have been compared with the thangka illustrations in the Blue Beryl. Another table (in addition to the one mentioned in the previous paragraph) contains five columns: 1) the textual survey of the *Bshad rgyud* as it appears in a modern edition, 2) citations indicating where to find each passage in the *Bshad rgyud*, 3) the numbering of the Labrang tree inscriptions, 4) the specifications of the leaves in BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS' text and 5) the number of the specific features within the Thangkas.

An evaluation of the medical terminology used in these texts and a discussion of these terms is included for the chapters describing the structure of the tree and its leaves. This was included in response to an examination of other contemporaneous translations.

The historical framing focuses on three periods: 1) the time when the author BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS created the intellectual pattern of the tree murals, 2) the establishment of the Medical College at Labrang and 3) the revitalisation of Tibetan Medicine and the Labrang murals in particular. The results revealed and described in relation to the first and third periods were especially interesting; these are ready to be published in a paper submitted in the journal "Asian Medicine"

 was there a change of direction in the field between the start and the end of the project? – If so, what form did the change take and what effect did it have on the work? In addition to the project proposal and in order to test the quality of the modern edition, the text of the *Bshad rgyud* was also compared with a copy of a block-print from Beijing stored in the Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin. All aberrations (which were found only in rare cases) where denoted within the table including the text of the *Bshad rgyud*.

During the research development phase it became clear that the first and third time periods mentioned above are of major importance in the scope of the murals. The second time period is still interesting but subordinate, however a transliteration of two Tibetan texts dealing with the history and foundations of the Medical College at Labrang (second period) are to be made available on my website (www.katharinasabernig.at)

2.1.2 most important results and brief description of their significance (main points) with regard to (8000 characters excl. spaces)

 contribution to the progress of the field (e.g. did the results contribute to an increased importance for the field and in what way?);

The project contributes in various ways to progress in the field of Asian and Tibetan medicine. It has advanced understanding historically, politically as well as in terms of contents. The examination of the work and activities of BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS has shed new light on the history of Tibetan Medicine in the seventeenth century in Lhasa and the development of didactic materials. There is now a greater understanding of disputes between different schools of interpretation. A portrait of the development of Tibetan Medicine around Labrang Monastery in the twentieth century – or more precisely before and after the military takeover in 1958 and after Cultural Revolution (1966-1976) – was generated. An interview with the painter of both versions of the murals was conducted. He is not a monk but educated in Tibetan Medicine as well as painting. His memories and those of some monks who have taken classes in the Medical College at Labrang have resulted in a vivid and personal portrayal of regional medical development

At the beginning of the project it was evident that there is a lack of research in the field of the commissioning of medical paintings in the seventeenth century as well as at the time of revitalisation, which started in the mid-nineteen eighties (cf. BLEZER et al. 2007). We are quite well informed on the activities around the Arura group in Xining and developments in Lhasa and its surroundings, but descriptions of recent medical activities in the area of Xiahe/Gannan prefecture are rare. So the results of this research close a gap in the pre-modern era and recent history of Tibetan Medicine.

Although the text of BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS is meant to explain the *Bshad rgyud* the contents of some chapters goes far beyond the information we know from the *Bshad rgyud* or other translations into a European language: particularly in the chapters on anatomy, nosology and pharmacology. New contributions of medical content can be noted. Preliminary results of the materia medica evaluated in this project have been discussed in an article (see SABERNIG 2011a) Some historical aspects of BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS' pharmacology will be presented at the DGV-Tagung in Mainz 2013 (Meeting of "Deutsche Gesellschaft für Völkerkunde).

breaking of new scientific ground

(i.e. to what extent and in what respect?);

The description of the murals in the Medical College at Labrang Monastery is breaking new scientific ground in that they have not been described at all so far. Their textual source: BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS, was identified. Both versions of the murals, one painted during the time of revitalisation in the mid-eighties as well as their repainted version (renovated in 2007) were photo-documented and all aberrations were indicated. New scientific ground was broken in the comparison of the murals and the thangkas in combination with the collation of BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS' text, the *Bshad rgyud* and its commentaries. This was necessary because both visual

didactic media date back to the same historical root: the medical development in Lhasa at the eve of the eighteenth century.

- most important development of hypotheses
 - (what relevance did the project have for the development of scientific hypotheses, e.g. were new hypotheses developed or old hypotheses disproved?);

The most important working theses could be proved and documented: that the text of BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS forms the written and intellectual basis of the murals and that the visual implementation of this theoretical tree structure still performs as a vivid didactic tool in the Medical College at Labrang monastery. (The differences between the old and new inscriptions have been denoted but are more interesting from a linguistic point of view than in their contribution to an understanding of the history of Tibetan Medicine). The cross-comparison of the contents of BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS' text and the Blue Beryl's thangkas in tabular form revealed that the murals and the thangkas show their full value if read together. With the help of the tables a striking connection between these media became visible. In many cases missing content in the thangkas is elaborated by the murals and vice versa. One established hypotheses in the field of the history of Tibetan Medicine was put into perspective: generally it is said that the medical metaphor of the unfolded tree is a tradition mainly taught by the *byang lugs* school, however BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS is an important proponent of the rivalling *zur lug* school. The use of the tree metaphor can be traced back to times before the formation of different schools of interpretation.

development of new methods;

The comparison of depicted contents with written sources is nothing new but the crosscomparison of two different visual representations combined with its written template (BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS' text), a core text *(Bshad rgyud)*, and respective commentaries is new in the field of Tibetan Medicine. This cross-linked investigative approach opened up new horizons in understanding the emphasis of contents in teaching Tibetan medicine.

 relevance for other (related) areas of science (transdisciplinary issues and methods).

The contribution of this research to the fields of Tibetan art and medical history were mentioned above. It is also worth mentioning its relevance in extending our understanding of Tibetan Medicine from a practitioner's or a student's point of view. The itemisation of the individual tree structures will be of great help in the process of teaching and learning. The concrete itemisation within the paintings demands a cautious use of Tibetan medical terminology, particularly the translation of vocabulary in the chapters dealing with anatomy, pathology and pharmacology. These needed to be commented upon extensively and will be an important aid in Tibetan medical practice. In the case of the botanical or biological classification of Tibetan pharmacological terms a list of biological equivalents and their sources has been compiled. This list contains almost four hundred medical ingredients identified in eighteen different sources. This list is in the process of being converted into a database, which can be easily expanded, formatted and made searchable on the Internet. This part of the research goes beyond the scope of the project and was undertaken in order to identify the materia medica in BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS' text. It will form the basis of a database for Tibetan medical vocabulary. Another aspect of this research is the wider scope of BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS', text which is relevant to an understanding of the general history of anatomy, in particular his contribution on the locomotor system, as it goes far beyond what is written in the commentaries of the Rgvud bzhi. A closer examination of the anatomical vocabulary he used as well as the historical framing of this new development in the history of anatomy form the basis of my next proposal.

2.1.3 information on the running of the project, use of the available funding and where appropriate any changes to the original project plan relating to (2000 characters excl. spaces)

duration;

The project lasted from October 2010 to November 2012. It was extended for one month without costs involved.

use of personnel;

This small stand alone project was designed as a half-time position. Informal cooperation with Theresia HOFER, Nikolay TSYREMPILOV and Natalia BOLSOKHOYEVA could be performed without costs. As an architect my sister Maria SABERNIG was instructed to design maps of the inner courtyard of the medical College at Labrang Monastery as well as to design a website for the project (total cost 400 \in). Oliver CORFF, mongolist, sinologist and manchurist and well experienced in the creation of digital databases for the purpose of publishing dictionaries was commissioned to analyse the structure of my pharmacological tables and convert them into a database which can be used to create an appendix of the above-mentioned materia medica in the scope of the publication of the monograph on the Labrang murals as well as for the output of Tibetan medical vocabulary gained in future research (450 \in).

larger items of equipment purchased;

none

• other significant deviation².

none

2

The assessment of what should be regarded as a "significant deviation" is the responsibility of the project leader. As a guideline, any deviation of more than 25% from the original financial plan or work schedule should be accounted for.

2.2. Personnel development – importance of the project for the scientific careers of those involved (including the project leader) (2000 characters excl. spaces)

• brief comments on particular developments (perspectives) There is no doubt that a stand alone project subsidised by the Austrian Science Fond is of great importance for the development of the project leader, it is an opportunity which enables me to establish a good reputation nationally and internationally.

 completed or anticipated special qualifications of project leader and/or any coworkers (whether funded by the FWF or not) as a result of the project.

However, due to collation of different classical texts and the study of secondary literature I could delve deeply into the historical dimensions of Tibetan Medicine and its terminology with the effect that my skills in the written classical Tibetan language have been improved.

 special possibilities opened up by the project (e.g. high-risk topics, intensification of transdisciplinary research etc.).

As a result of this project I became an associated researcher at the Institute of Social Anthropology at the Austrian Academy of Sciences and could strengthen my external position at the Unit Ethnomedicine and International Health of the Department for General Medicine at the Centre for Public Health, Medical University of Vienna. Due to my meticulous examination of the trees, leaves and general medical contents I received some appreciation from local Tibetan physicians.

importance (effect, success) of these new possibilities.

I became a lecturer at the Department of South Asian, Tibetan and Buddhist Studies of the University of Vienna in the summer terms of 2012 and will do so again in 2013 as well as at the Medical University at Vienna for Tibetan Medicine.

 effects of the project and of research performed in the framework of the project on the international reputation of the project leader and co-workers.

In order to give a lecture about the Labrang murals I was invited to Berlin twice, once to the Museum of Asian Art on 24th February 2011, and the second time to the Institute of Asian and African Studies, Faculty of Philosophy III at the Humbolt University zu Berlin on 15th June 2011. As a result of my informal cooperation with Theresia HOFER an article about the murals will be published in the exhibition catalogue of the Rubin Museum of Art called *Bodies in Balance -The Art of Tibetan Medicine*.

establishment or intensification of international collaborations.

At four international conferences (see point 4) different aspects of the murals in the Medical College at Labrang Monastery where presented and discussed. The subject of research was promoted and discussed with other experts in the field with the effect that it enhanced my reputation in the field internationally. Contact with colleagues in the field was established or intensified, and as a result I was invited to give a paper at the next IATS Seminar 2013 to be held in Ulan Bator.

2.3 effects of the project outside the scientific field

(2000 characters excl. spaces)

- brief comments on particular developments (perspectives); Once the monograph is published it will be of great help in teaching Tibetan Medicine.
- organization of symposiums and conferences;

None were organised

 did the project have any particular relevance for developments in teaching and if so, what (incorporation of project results in lectures, seminars etc.)?

Various aspects of this project could be presented in the 2012 lecture course on ethno-medical and historical perspectives of Tibetan Medicine. Other aspects will be presented in the lecture course in the summer term of 2013.

particular public relations activities for the general public

The art-historical aspects of the project where presented twice to the general public within a series of courses called "University Meets Public" in Vienna. A presentation of the project in the research forum of the Institute of Social Anthropology at the Austrian Academy of Sciences (28. October 2010) was also open to the general public.

 did the project have particular relevance for other areas of society (cooperations with economy, effects on society, widespread impact, adult education etc.)?

Outside the scientific field the most important societal impact of this research will be found within the circle of interested Tibetan scholars and students of Tibetan Medicine. There is no doubt that the visual presentation of medical content as they are depicted in the Labrang murals are a helpful and joyful tool in Tibetan medical education – for Tibetans as well as Non-Tibetans. The presentation of the structure of contents with the help of the tree metaphor which can be seen or even touched is an effective visual tool in educating adults as well as children.

3. Information on project participants

not funded by th	ne FWF		f		
			u n		
			d		
			e d		
			b		
			у		
			ĥ		
			e		
			F.		
			W		
			F		
			(
			p		
			ir i		
			ο		
			j		
			e		
			c t		
)		
co-workers	number	Person- months	co-workers	number	Person -months
non-scientific			non-scientific	1	several
co-workers			co-workers		hours
diploma students			diploma students		
PhD students			PhD students		
post-doctoral			post-doctoral	1	several
co-workers			co-workers		hours
co-workers with			co-workers with		
"Habilitation"			"Habilitation"		
(professorial			(professorial		
and a life a time a			qualifications)		
qualifications) professors			professors		

4. Attachments

(lists may be as long as required)

List 1

1.a. scientific publications³

with an indication of the status (published, in press, submitted, in preparation)

Open Access: http://www.fwf.ac.at/de/public relations/oai/index.html

If the project could not follow the FWF Open Access Policy for some or for all publications (1.a.1 to 1.a.3) please list the reasons:

Publications may only be listed if they relate directly to the project. **Up to three of the most important publications** should be indicated (e.g. printed in bold letters). Please note that publication costs may be requested (under the original project number) for up to three years following completion of a project.

A common format for citations should be followed.

1.a.1. Peer-reviewed publications (journals, contribution to anthologies, working papers, proceedings etc.)

published

1) SABERNIG, Katharina 2011a. The substitution of rare ingredients in traditional Tibetan medicine on the basis of classical Tibetan texts, their use in modern formularies and a case study from Amdo/Qinghai. In: *New Trends in Ethnobotany and Ethnopharmacology: Selected Contributions of 6th European Colloquium of Ethnopharmacology / 20th conference "Ethnomedicine" / Medical Anthropology at Leipzig 8th to 10th November 2007.* Curare 34 (2011)1+2. p. 83-96.

2) SABERNIG, Katharina 2011b. The Medical College at Labrang Monastery in Eastern Tibet: A Historical and Ethnomedical Study and Documentation of 19 Murals Illustrating the bshad rgyud. In: *Viennese Ethnomedicine Newsletter, volume XIV, number 1*. Austria p. 17-24.

submitted

3) SABERNIG, Katharina (forthcoming). *Tibetan Medical Paintings illustrating the bshad rgyud.* ~ 15 pages (ZAS).

4) SABERNIG, Katharina (forthcoming). On the history of the *murals in the medical college of Labrang*. ~ 15 pages (Asian Medicine).

1.a.2. Non peer-reviewed publications (journals, contribution to anthologies research reports, working papers, proceedings, etc.)

1.a.3. Stand-alone publications (monographies, anthologies)

in preparation:

³

The publication list must mention for each work: all authors; full title; series/journal title; year; volume; and page numbers. Furthermore, if publications are freely available in the internet, please add the URL of the publication.

SABERNIG, Katharina. Workingtitel "*The Murals at Labrang Monastery*", Two Volumes Vol. I:

contains analysis and translation of the murals entire content including a comparison with the thangkas illustrating the "Blue Beryl", a historical introduction and photographic material in colour, about 450 pages.

Vol. II:

contains photographic material of the murals in black and white with inserted red enumeration of all trunks and branches of the medical trees, including all tables:

1) previous and actual inscriptions of the murals in comparison with BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS' Text, 2) complete comparison of the murals' leaves with the help of BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS' Text, and both the *bshad rgyud* and the Blue Beryl thangkas, 3) appendices, references, indices etc. about 350 pages.

1.b. publications for the general public and other publications

such as films, exhibitions, preparation of a home page etc. with an indication of the status (published, submitted / in preparation)

1) SABERNIG, Katharina (forthcoming). Medical Murals at Labrang Monastery. In: *Bodies in Balance -The Art of Tibetan Medicine*. Exibition catalogue: Rubin Museum of Art.

List 2 project-related participation in international scientific conferences (with an indication of the conference date) – 4 subunits:

2.1. Conference participations - invited lectures

none

2.2. Conference participations - lectures

1) 55 PIAC Annual Meeting, July 22-27, 2012 in Cluj-Napoca
 2) Ethnomedizinische Tagung der Arge Ethnomedizin in Wien, 17-18. Sept. 2011

3) 10th IAMS in Ulaanbaatar, August, 9-13, 2011

4) 12th Seminar of IATS in Vancouver, August 15-22, 2011

2.3. Conference participations - posters

1) part of poster: 55 PIAC Annual Meeting, July 22-27,2012 in Cluj-Napoca

2.4. Conference participations - other

List 3 Development of collaborations

Indication of the most important collaborations (maximum 5), that took place (initiated or continued) in collaboration please give the name of the collaboration partner (name, title, institution) and a few words about the scientific content. Please also assign one of the following **categories** to each collaboration:

Ν			Nature	N (national); E (European); I (other international cooperation)
	E		Extent E1 E2 E3	 low (e.g. no joint publications but mention in acknowledgements or similar); medium (collaboration e.g. with occasional joint publications, exchange of materials or similar but no longer-term exchange of personnel); high (extensive collaboration with mutual hosting of group members for research stays, regular joint publications etc.)
		D	Discipline	D within the disciplineT transdisciplinary

N E		D	Collaboration partner	Collaboration partner / content of the collaboration		
			1) Name: Institution:	Title:		
			Content:			
			2) Name: Institution:	Title:		
			Content:			
			3) Name: Institution: Content:	Title:		
			4) Name: Institution: Content:	Title:		
			5) Name: Institution: Content:	Title:		

Note: general scientific contacts and occasional meetings should not be considered as collaborations in the above sense.

List 4 "Habilitations" (professorial qualifications) / PhD theses / diploma theses

with an indication of the status (in progress / completed)

Note: it will not be possible to assign a "Habilitation" to a single project; what is required here is a mention of those "Habilitations" for which the project was important. A similar caveat applies to PhD and diploma theses: the FWF does not support thesis work but rather funds the scientific work that forms the basis for theses.

4.1. Professorial Qualifications

none

4.2. PhD Theses

1) some results of this research form the basis for my PhD Theses in Cultural and Social anthropology.

4.3. Diploma Theses

List 5 Effects of the project outside the scientific field (where appropriate)

Sections of the list:

5.1. Organization of scientific events

The listing should be ordered according to

- congresses, symposiums or workshops with participants from outside Austria
- congresses, symposiums or workshops with participants primarily from within Austria
- meetings relevant to the project (e.g. with collaboration partners from science and industry, EU partners etc.)

5.2. Particular honours, prizes etc.

The listing should be divided into national and international honours, prizes etc. none

5.3. Information on results relevant to commercial applications

The listing should be divided into national and international patents (licenses etc.) none

5.4. Other effects beyond the scientific field

Please describe briefly any implications / presentations for social, ecological, medical, economic and/or technical or cultural areas.

As described in 2.3.

5.5. Relevance of the project in the organization of the relevant scientific discipline

Contributions to image building, establishment of "priority areas", role in performance-related contracts or similar.

Together with Stephan CLOOS, Therasia HOFER and me three scientists publishing on different aspects of Tibetan medicine are connected with the Institute of Social Anthropology of the Austrian Academy of Sciences.

List 6. Applications for follow-up projects

with an indication of the status (submitted / approved) and the funding organization.

6.1 Applications for follow-up projects (FWF projects)

(with an indication of the project type, e.g. stand-alone project, NFN, SFB, WK, fellowship, contribution to a stand-alone publication)

1) The anatomical achievement of BLO BZANG CHOS GRAGS at the eve of the eighteenth century revealed in this research is remarkable and worth to be analysed in the scope of the history of anatomy. Contents, terminology and the historical framing are part of an following-up standalone project applied with this final report.

6.2 Applications for follow-up projects (Other national projects)

(e. g. FFG, CD Laboratory, a K-plus Centre, funding from the Austrian National Bank, the Federal Government, the provincial government or similar)

6.3 Applications for follow-up projects (International projects) (eg. ERA project, ESF)

5. Zusammenarbeit mit dem FWF

Sie werden gebeten folgende Aspekte der Zusammenarbeit

mit dem FWF zu bewerten. Anmerkungen (Ausführungen)

unter Verweis auf den entsprechenden Referenzpunkt bitte auf Beiblatt.

Skala

- -2 sehr unzufriedenstellend,
- -1 unzufriedenstellend;
- **0** angemessen;
- +1 zufriedenstellend;
- +2 sehr zufriedenstellend.

Wertung

X nicht beansprucht

Regelwerk

(Richtlinien für Programm, Antrag, Verwendung, Bericht)

Antragsrichtlinien	Umfang	1
_	Übersichtlichkeit	1
	Verständlichkeit	1

Verfahren (Einreichung, Begutachtung, Entscheidung)

	2
Beratung	
	0
Dauer des Verfahrens	
	1
Transparenz	

Projektbegleitung

Beratung	Verfügbarkeit	2
		2
	Ausführlichkeit	
		2
	Verständlichkeit	

	2
Durchführung Finanzverkehr	
(Überweisungen, Gerätebeschaffungen, Personalwesen)	

Berichtswesen/ Prüfung/ Verwertung

		1
Aufwar	nd	
		1
Transp	arenz	
		1
Unters	tützung bei ichkeitsarbeit/ Verwertung	
Offentl	ichkeitsarbeit/ Verwertung	

2. Anmerkungen zur Zusammenarbeit mit dem FWF:

Ich möchte mich insbesondere für die sehr gute Betreuung durch Frau Dr. Beatrix Asamer bedanken.

Ich möchte mich zudem ausdrücklich für die Möglichkeit einer Halbzeit-Projektstelle auf Basis eines Gewerbescheins bedanken. Diese Form eignet sich hervorragend dazu Frauen im Wissenschaftsbetrieb zu fördern.

Vielen Dank

Mag. Dr. Katharina Sabernig